

# Histori Publikasi

- Pendaftaran akun ke jurnal: 07 April 2022: [IJCJS] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink
- Submit Paper: 07 April 2022; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
- Keputusan Editor: 9 April 2022; [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
- Keputusan Editor: 20 Juni 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revision: 17 Agustus 2022: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 25 September 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision
- Submit Revision: 13 Oktober 2022: [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission
- Keputusan Editor: 05 November 2022: [IJCJS] Editor Decision



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Thu, Apr 07, 2022, at 07:25 AM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

This mail is to let you know that your account (Signin ID: [gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)) was created at the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

[NOTE] Before starting to use ManuscriptLink service, you need to confirm your email address (signin ID) by clicking the link below:

<https://www.manuscriptlink.com/user/confirm/1e3514eb9fa24d43bba7f2e10154a8e8>

Through the following link, you can access the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs?id=gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

In the ManuscriptLink online system,

\* If you are an author of manuscript, you can submit a manuscript and keep a close watch over the on-going review process including the review history of past manuscripts.

\* If you are a manager of a journal, you can create and manage a new journal submission and review service, and customize your service according to the demand of editorial members.

\* If you are an editorial member of a journal, you can manage a review process for a submitted manuscript and enhance the academic value of the journal by accepting or rejecting publication of submitted manuscripts.

\* If you are a reviewer of a journal, you can evaluate a submitted manuscript and send your review report to editorial members of the journal.

Best regards,

ManuscriptLink Support Team

Email: [support@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:support@manuscriptlink.com)

<https://www.manuscriptlink.com>

Terms of Service and Privacy Policy

Terms of Service : <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/termsOfService>

Privacy Policy: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/privacyPolicy>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id >

## IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Thu, Apr 07, 2022, at 9:56 AM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases

Author(s): Gunardi Lie; Lewiandy

Corresponding Author: Gunardi Lie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: School of law, Universitas Tarumanagara, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Apr-2022 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

---

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

---

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Sat, Apr 9, 2022, at 02:01 PM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases

Author(s): Gunardi Lie; Lewiandy

Corresponding Author: Gunardi Lie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: School of law, Universitas Tarumanagara, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Apr-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-524-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Mon, Jun 20, 2021, at 10:10 AM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases".

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief  
*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*  
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail

---

### Reviewer- A

#### Decision: Major revisions required

This manuscript aims to analyze the possibilities of Blockchain technology in upgrading Indonesian property law and its future utility in property-related transactions, especially with regard to the bankruptcy law regime. Both statutory and case-based approaches were used as the research methodology to collect authentic data related to blockchain technology benefiting the upgradation of property law. The statutory approach helped in understanding the pertinent laws and regulations, while the case-based approach helped study the law's social and financial implications. The data analysis technique adopted was a descriptive-analytical approach. Since the study was made from a legal and economic perspective, the findings included a positive view of property law in Indonesia when blockchain technology is adopted, with some exceptions of bankruptcy cases where the execution failed due to property law problems. The study highlighted factors that could help the property regulations upgrade. It is a very well-written article. Overall, there are a few suggestions and comments for the authors to make this work worth publishing in the prestigious journal.

1. In the introduction, while writing blockchain is a technology that enables the existence of cryptocurrency, authors should mention the types of cryptocurrencies. How is Indonesian property law regulated? Under Indonesian property law, what is the definition of bankruptcy?
  2. Throughout the literature section, the authors used similar research results to the existing research when they elaborated on their point of view without logical arguments. That weakens the arguments, and the current arguments are not persuasive enough to convince the readers that this paper has contributions. So please rewrite the literature review part, specifically explaining the Colonial legacy and evolution of Property Law.
  3. The authors should also separately discuss the Indonesian Securities Law in detail, along with an explanation of the Blockchain Technology and Its Implications.
  4. Methodologically this study utilized secondary data derived from prior studies, publications, and case studies. In this regard, the method of analysis chosen is good.
  5. Authors are encouraged to add the Problem Statement and Conceptual Framework of the study in detail.
  6. The results and findings are also presented well. However, there is still room for improvement. There is a need to add a Figure representing Indonesian Crypto Investor Growth
  7. There is also a need to add a conclusion section followed by a discussion part.
  8. Authors should follow the APA 7th edition to record all the references in this study. Also, there is a need to add DOIs for all the references.
- 

## **Reviewer -B**

### **Decision: Major revisions required**

The article Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases addresses a very critical topic with a good presentation of laws and regulations linked with the phenomenon. Here are some concerns which are important to reply to before making a decision regarding this paper.

- i. The introduction of the topic is very brief. A detailed introduction is required to better understand the research gap and research problem. Although Indonesia has banned cryptocurrencies as a payment instrument, it is still being traded as a commodity because, as a developing region, Indonesia cannot get itself separated from the whole world. Also, Law no. 5/1960 on Basic Agrarian Principles needs more explanation.
- ii. The literature review needs to be much more clearly written. The Property Laws in Indonesia need to be explained further, and the ideas must be more clearly linked. An in-depth literature review is required to build arguments and logical facts with a clear understanding of the main concepts. Particularly authors should add subsections for the explanation of the main ideas.

- iii. The authors should also address an important question as to whether Crypto Assets (property) have the same treatment, definition, and function as cryptocurrency. Build your arguments based on the fact that cryptocurrency is a sub-class category of Crypto Assets, but not all Crypto Assets are cryptocurrencies.
- iv. Implications for Indonesia's organizational performance must be added with adequate evidence.
- v. I encourage the authors to write a discussion section independent of the results. There is a need to discuss the study results in detail independent of implications, clearly stating the significance of the results and their applicability as per the study context with specific examples of existing laws and regulations. There is also a need to identify potential future research areas.
- vi. The authors should thoroughly follow the journal guidelines for quoting full-text citations and adding a conclusion section.

---

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id >

## [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Wed, Aug 17, 2022, at 01:29 PM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases

Author(s): Gunardi Lie; Lewiandy

Corresponding Author: Gunardi Lie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: School of law, Universitas Tarumanagara, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Apr-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-524-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



## RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-A

1. **Comment:** This manuscript aims to analyze the possibilities of Blockchain technology in upgrading Indonesian property law and its future utility in property-related transactions, especially with regard to the bankruptcy law regime. Both statutory and case-based approaches were used as the research methodology to collect authentic data related to blockchain technology benefiting the upgradation of property law. The statutory approach helped in understanding the pertinent laws and regulations, while the case-based approach helped study the law's social and financial implications. The data analysis technique adopted was a descriptive-analytical approach. Since the study was made from a legal and economic perspective, the findings included a positive view of property law in Indonesia when blockchain technology is adopted, with some exceptions of bankruptcy cases where the execution failed due to property law problems. The study highlighted factors that could help the property regulations upgrade. It is a very well-written article. Overall, there are a few suggestions and comments for the authors to make this work worth publishing in the prestigious journal.

**Revision:** Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind remarks. We have revised the manuscript as per comments and suggestions as follows:

2. **Comment:** In the introduction, while writing blockchain is a technology that enables the existence of cryptocurrency, authors should mention the types of cryptocurrencies. How is Indonesian property law regulated? Under Indonesian property law, what is the definition of bankruptcy?

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, We have revised the introduction by writing blockchain is a technology that enables the existence of cryptocurrency. We have also mentioned the types of cryptocurrencies and how Indonesian property law is regulated. We have also defined bankruptcy under Indonesian property law. Please see pages 2-5

3. **Comment:** Throughout the literature section, the authors used similar research results to the existing research when they elaborated on their point of view without logical arguments. That weakens the arguments, and the current arguments are not persuasive enough to convince

the readers that this paper has contributions. So please rewrite the literature review part, specifically explaining the colonial legacy and evolution of Property Law.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind suggestions and comments. We have now revised the literature section with logical arguments and explained the colonial legacy and evolution of Property Law. Please see pages 5-13

4. **Comment:** The authors should also separately discuss the Indonesian Securities Law in detail, along with an explanation of Blockchain Technology and Its Implications.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, we have discussed the Indonesian Securities Law in detail, along with an explanation of Blockchain Technology and Its Implications. Please see pages 14-16

5. **Comment:** Methodologically this study utilized secondary data derived from prior studies, publications, and case studies. In this regard, the method of analysis chosen is good.

**Revision:** Many thanks, dear reviewer.

6. **Comment:** Authors are encouraged to add the Problem Statement and Conceptual Framework of the study in detail.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 12-13

7. **Comment:** The results and findings are also presented well. However, there is still room for improvement. There is a need to add a Figure representing Indonesian Crypto Investor Growth

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 16-19

8. **Comment:** There is also a need to add a conclusion section followed by a discussion part.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, we have added a conclusion section followed by a discussion part. Please see pages 20-21

9. **Comment:** Authors should follow the APA 7th edition to record all the references in this study. Also, there is a need to add DOIs for all the references.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done as suggested.

## **RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-B**

1. **Comment:** The article *Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases* addresses a very critical topic with a good presentation of laws

and regulations linked with the phenomenon. Here are some concerns which are important to reply to before making a decision regarding this paper.

**Revision:** Thanks a lot, dear reviewer, for allowing us to revise the manuscript and for your kind comments and concerns.

2. **Comment:** The introduction of the topic is very brief. A detailed introduction is required to better understand the research gap and research problem. Although Indonesia has banned cryptocurrencies as a payment instrument, it is still being traded as a commodity because, as a developing region, Indonesia cannot get itself separated from the whole world. Also, Law no. 5/1960 on Basic Agrarian Principles needs more explanation.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, I have revised the introduction as suggested and also explained Law no. 5/1960 on Basic Agrarian Principles. Please see pages 2-5

3. **Comment:** The literature review needs to be much more clearly written. The Property Laws in Indonesia need to be explained further, and the ideas must be more clearly linked. An in-depth literature review is required to build arguments and logical facts with a clear understanding of the main concepts. Particularly authors should add subsections for the explanation of the main ideas.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, we have thoroughly revised the literature review and added subsections for the explanation of the main ideas. Please see pages 5-13

4. **Comment:** The authors should also address an important question as to whether Crypto Assets (property) have the same treatment, definition, and function as cryptocurrency. Build your arguments based on the fact that cryptocurrency is a sub-class category of Crypto Assets, but not all Crypto Assets are cryptocurrencies.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, we have discussed the important question of whether Crypto Assets (property) have the same treatment, definition, and function as cryptocurrency. Build your arguments based on the fact that cryptocurrency is a sub-class category of Crypto Assets, but not all Crypto Assets are cryptocurrencies. Please see page 14

5. **Comment:** Implications for Indonesia's organizational performance must be added with adequate evidence.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done s suggested. Please see page 17.

6. **Comment:** I encourage the authors to write a discussion section independent of the results. There is a need to discuss the study results in detail independent of implications, clearly stating the significance of the results and their applicability as per the study context with specific examples of existing laws and regulations. There is also a need to identify potential future research areas.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done s suggested. Please see pages 19-21

7. **Comment:** The authors should thoroughly follow the journal guidelines for quoting full-text citations and adding a conclusion section.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done s suggested.



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Sun, Sep 25, 2022, at 09:14 AM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases."

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.

Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief  
*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*  
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>



**IJCJS-524-2022\_review.docx**  
37Kb

=====[Note]=====  
This email is only for the delivery service.  
Please do not reply to this mail

-----



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Thur, Oct 13, 2022, at 04:12 PM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases

Author(s): Gunardi Lie; Lewiandy

Corresponding Author: Gunardi Lie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: School of law, Universitas Tarumanagara, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Apr-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-524-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

\* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

## RESPONSE TO REVIEWER

1. **Comment:** The authors' reviewers suggested acceptance of the manuscript with few changes.

**Revision:** Thanks a lot once again, dear reviewer, for your kind consideration and kind remarks

2. **The** author/authors should add a paragraph on how this paper is organized in a specific order.

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, we have added a paragraph regarding the organization of the paper. Please see page 5

3. **Comment:** Indonesian civil law indoctrinates classified properties differently. What is the most prominent classification for this research?

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see page 11

4. **Comment:** What is the main objective behind allowing the trading of cryptocurrencies in Indonesia?

**Revision:** Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see page 14



Gunardi Lie <gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id>

## [IJCJS] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCJS <[no-reply@manuscriptlink.com](mailto:no-reply@manuscriptlink.com)>

Sat, Nov 05, 2022, at 09:41 AM

To: Gunardi Lie <[gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id](mailto:gunardi.lie@untar.ac.id)>

Dear Dr. Gunardi Lie,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Block Chain Application on Property Law: Meeting Legal Certainty for Creditors in Bankruptcy Cases

Author(s): Gunardi Lie; Lewiandy

Corresponding Author: Gunardi Lie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: School of law, Universitas Tarumanagara, Jakarta, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 07-Apr-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-524-2022

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 17 No. 2, 2022). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.